



Republic of the Philippines  
Presidential Electoral Tribunal  
Manila

NOTICE

Sirs/Mesdames:

*Please take notice that the Tribunal issued a Resolution dated JULY 24, 2018, which reads as follows:*

**“P.E.T. Case No. 005** (Ferdinand ‘Bongbong’ R. Marcos, Jr. vs. Maria Leonor ‘Leni Daang Matuwid’ G. Robredo).- Acting on the following Incident Reports relative to the on-going revision of ballots, the Tribunal Resolved to

(i) **CONFIRM THE ACTION** to proceed with the revision and to merely reflect in the Revision Report that the Minutes of Voting (MOVs) were improvised, as stated in the Incident Report dated July 3, 2018 re: Table No. 32, to quote: ‘Allowed to proceed with revision but note in Revision Report that MOV is improvised (handwritten); Previous day’s supervisor allowed revision to proceed’;

(ii) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated July, 4, 2018 (Re: Report of the Head Revisor of Table No. 2 that there were instances when the Revision Supervisor/s ordered the suspension of the revision on the ground that there is no MOV, Election Return (ER) and/or other election documents found inside the ballot box); and **DIRECT** the Revision Committee to continue with the revision even if (1) there is no MOV or ER inside the ballot box or (2) the MOV is improvised, absent any showing that the integrity of the ballot box and the ballots was compromised;

(iii) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated July 4, 2018 (Re: Observation that Several Head Revisors and Party Revisors Have Been Using Pens Not Issued By the Tribunal); **REITERATE** Rule 31(A)(1), Presidential Electoral Tribunal (PET) Revisor’s Guide for the Revision of Ballots under the Automated Election System (PET Revisor’s Guide), which strictly prohibits the bringing of personal belongings such as writing instruments inside the revision hall; and **DIRECT** the PET Security Personnel to **STRICTLY ENFORCE** the rules, otherwise, a repetition of the subject violation and other similar acts shall be dealt with more severely;



(iv) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated July 4, 2018 re: Clustered Precinct No. 34 (Precincts 75B, 76A and 77A), Brgy. Dalid, Municipality of Calinog, Iloilo, at Table No. 22, which reads 'Head Revisor of Table No. 22 reported that only one plastic seal, still intact, was found outside the ballot box while the other three plastic seals, already cut, were found inside the ballot box. Aside from one plastic seal, ballot box was sealed with packaging tape which was probably signed by BEI'; **APPROVE** the recommendation to 'suspend the revision due to question on the integrity of the ballots as the ballot box could have been reopened after sealing it'; and **DIRECT** the PET Retrieval Team, through Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan, to **INFORM** the Tribunal, within ten (10) days from notice hereof, if such fact as observed in the subject Incident Report has been reported by the Municipal Treasurer of Calinog, Iloilo, during the retrieval of the ballot boxes;

(v) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated July 4, 2018 re: Clustered Precinct No. 38 (Precincts 0085A, 0085B and 0086A), Brgy. Garangan, Municipality of Calinog, Iloilo, at Table No. 32, which reads 'The Revision Committee #32 noted a discrepancy in the signature of the BEI Chairman in the ballots (one similar signature in all ballots) and in the MOV, the envelope containing the MOV, the ER, and the envelope containing the ER (one similar signature in all these documents)'; and **DIRECT** the Revision Committee to (1) **CONTINUE** with the revision and (2) **REFLECT** the afore-quoted observation in their Revision Report;

(vi) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated July 9, 2018 re: Clustered Precinct No. 14 (Precincts 0028A, 0029A, 0029B and 0030A), Brgy. Bancal, Municipality of Carles, Iloilo, at Table No. 3, which reads 'Wet ballots that are clumped together. There appears to be mold on the ballots. No apparent or evident cracks on the ballot box'; and **APPROVE** the recommendation to stop revision because the ballots cannot be separated without damaging the ballots and use decrypted ballot images pursuant to Rule 74(c) of the PET Revisor's Guide; and

(vii) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated July 10, 2018 re: Clustered Precinct No. 42 (Precincts 89A, 89B and 90A), Brgy. Granada, Municipality of Carles, Iloilo, at Table No. 5, which reads 'The signatures of the BEI Chairman (Ramil M. Ignacio) on the ballots are glaringly different from those on the paper seals and the minutes of voting. There are also seven (7) ballots without the BEI Chairman's signature'; and **DIRECT** the Revision Committee to (1) **CONTINUE** with the revision and (2) **REFLECT** the afore-quoted observations in their Revision Report.



The Tribunal further Resolved to

(a) **NOTE WITHOUT ACTION** the Counter-Manifestation with Motion to Release CCTV Footage of the Revisor of Protestant Ferdinand R. Marcos, Jr. dated July 10, 2018 filed by counsel for protestee Maria Leonor G. Robredo, praying that a resolution be issued allowing the release of the Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) footage of Roderick Miranda leaving a bag of snacks prior to June 22, 2018;

(b) **NOTE** the Payment of Court Fine issued by the Cash Collection and Disbursement Division, Fiscal Management and Budget Office, stating that the amount of Fifty Thousand Pesos (P50,000.00) was received from protestant Ferdinand R. Marcos, Jr. on July 11, 2018 under O.R. No. 214433-SC-EP in compliance with the resolution dated June 26, 2018;

(c) **NOTE** the Counter-Manifestation (to the Manifestation and Motion [in Lieu of Comment] Dated July 4, 2018 Filed By the Office of the Solicitor General), dated July 12, 2018 filed by counsel for protestee Robredo;

(d) **NOTE** the Letter dated June 14, 2018 filed by Maria Victoria B. Riva, Municipal Treasurer, Municipality of Garchitorena, Camarines Sur, in compliance with the resolution dated April 24, 2018, submitting her explanation as to why the subject ballots (in Item [i], paragraph [9] of the resolution dated April 24, 2018) were wet or damaged;

(e) **DIRECT** the

(i) Board of Election Inspectors for Clustered Precincts 24, Precinct Nos. 0044A and 0044B, Brgy. Salvacion, Municipality of Garchitorena, and former Municipal Treasurer of Garchitorena, Camarines Sur, to **EXPLAIN** why the ballots were wet or damaged within a **NON-EXTENDIBLE** period of ten (10) days from notice hereof; and

(ii) PET Retrieval Team, through Atty. Alindogan, to **INFORM** the Tribunal of the Team's observations of the ballot box when it was retrieved, likewise within a **NON-EXTENDIBLE** period of ten (10) days from notice hereof;

(f) **NOTE** the Reply (to the Comment/Opposition dated May 24, 2018 of protestant Marcos) dated July 13, 2018 filed by counsel for the Commission on Elections (COMELEC) in compliance with the resolution dated July 3, 2018;



(g) **LIFT** the Preliminary Protection Order on the Election Management System servers;

(h) **ALLOW** the COMELEC to exercise the first option, at the cost of the protestant;

(i) **DIRECT** the COMELEC to **MAINTAIN** custody, and **PRESERVE** and **SAFEGUARD** the integrity of the backed-up or cloned data;

(j) **NOTE** the Letter dated July 16, 2018 of Atty. Jose M. Tolentino, Jr., Executive Director, COMELEC, and **GRANT** the request of Nilo R. Aranda, Municipal Treasurer, San Antonio, Quezon, for authority to transfer the storage area of the ballot boxes used in the 2013 and 2016 elections from its present storage room inside the Municipal Building to the Evacuation Center in Barangay Buliran, subject to the following conditions:

(i) Municipal Treasurer Aranda shall give the Tribunal and the parties prior notice of the date of the transfer; and

(ii) The parties shall be allowed to observe the activity;

(k) **NOTE WITHOUT ACTION** the Letter dated July 18, 2018 of Cynthia Patag, Puerto Real, La Paz, Iloilo, one of the concerned voters from Iloilo Province, asking the Tribunal to protect the sanctity of the ballots by upholding the twenty-five percent (25%) threshold in this election protest;

(l) **NOTE** the Compliance dated July 19, 2018 filed by counsel for protestant Marcos, Jr., manifesting that he has paid the amount of Fifty Thousand Pesos (₱50,000.00) in compliance with the resolution dated June 26, 2018; and

(m) **NOTE** the Comment (on the Urgent Motion for Reconsideration [of the resolution dated April 10, 2018] with Reiterative Prayer to Immediately Direct the Head Revisors to Use the Twenty-Five [25%] Threshold Percentage in the Revision, Recount and Re-Appreciation of Ballots Dated April 18, 2018 Filed By counsel for protestee Robredo), dated July 18, 2018 filed by counsel for the COMELEC in compliance with the resolution dated July 10, 2018.

Acting on the Strong Opposition (to the Use of Decrypted Ballot Images for the Judicial Revision and Recount of Ballots for the Pilot Protested Precincts Subject of This Election Protest) dated July 16, 2018 filed by counsel for protestant Marcos, Jr., the Court Resolved to **DIRECT**



July 24, 2018

the COMELEC to **COMMENT** thereon within a **NON-EXTENDIBLE** period of five (5) days from notice hereof." (1a)

Very truly yours,

**EDGAR O. ARICHETA**

Clerk of the Tribunal *mlme*

**Atty. George Erwin M. Garcia and  
Atty. Joan M. Padilla (x)**  
*Counsels for the Protestant*  
G.E. Garcia Law Office  
Ground Floor Laiko Building  
372 Cabildo Street  
Intramuros, 1002 Manila

**(Ret.) Justice Jose C. Vitug (x)**  
373 Matienzo Street, San Miguel, Manila

**Atty. Angelito C. Imperio (x)**  
17 Third Street, Saint Ignatius Village  
Quezon City

**Atty. Irene Ragodon-Guevarra (x)**  
Lot 12, Blk 25 Carnation Street  
Primrose Hills Subdivision  
Mahabang Parang, Angono, Rizal

**The Revision Supervisor and the Revision  
Committee at Table No. 32 (x)**  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila  
(with copy of Incident Report dated July 3, 2018 re  
Table No. 32)

**The Revision Committee at Table No. 2 (x)**  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila  
(with copy of Incident Report dated July 4, 2018  
Re: Report of the Head Revisor of Table No. 2 that  
there were instances when the Revision Supervisor/s  
ordered the suspension of the revision on the ground  
that there is no MOV, ER and/or other election  
documents found inside the ballot box)

**All Party Revisors (x)**  
**All Head Revisors (x)**  
c/o Eden G. Chan  
Judicial Staff Officer IV, PET  
**PET Security Personnel**  
c/o Joery L. Gayanan (x)  
Assistant Chief Security Officer  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila

**Atty. Romulo B. Macalintal (x)**  
*Lead Counsel for the Protestee*  
Sardillo Sardillo Salom Law Office  
Unit 802, Taipan Place  
F. Ortigas Avenue  
Ortigas Center, Pasig City

**The Revision Committee at Table No. 22 (x)**  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila  
**Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan (x)**  
Court Attorney VI  
Office of the Chief Attorney  
Head, PET Retrieval Team  
(with copies of Incident Report dated July 4, 2018 re CP#34  
[Precincts 75B, 76A and 77A], Brgy. Dalid, Municipality of  
Calinog, Iloilo)

**The Revision Committee at Table No. 32 (x)**  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila  
(with copy of Incident Report dated July 4, 2018 re CP# 38  
[Precincts 0085A, 0085B and 0086A], Brgy. Garangan,  
Municipality of Calinog, Iloilo)

**The Revision Committee at Table No. 3 (x)**  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila  
(with copy of Incident Report dated July 9, 2018 re CP# 14  
[Precincts 0028A, 0029A, 0029B and 0030A], Brgy. Bancal,  
Municipality of Carles, Iloilo)

**The Revision Committee at Table No. 5 (x)**  
c/o PET Office  
SC-CA Compound  
Supreme Court, Manila  
(with copy of Incident Report dated July 10, 2018 re CP# 42  
[Precincts 89A, 89B and 90A], Brgy. Granada, Municipality of  
Carles, Iloilo)

**The Officer-in-Charge (x)**  
Cash Collection and Disbursement Division  
Fiscal Management and Budget Office  
Supreme Court, Manila



**Maria Victoria B. Riva** (reg)  
Municipal Treasurer  
Municipality of Garchitorena  
Camarines Sur

**Board of Election Inspectors for Clustered  
Precincts 24, Precinct Nos. 0044A and 0044B,  
Brgy. Salvacion, Municipality of  
Garchitorena, Camarines Sur** (x)  
c/o The Election Officer  
Office of the Election Officer  
Municipality of Garchitorena  
Camarines Sur  
(with copy of Incident Report dated April 18, 2018  
relative to Table No. 20, Municipality of  
Garchitorena, Brgy. Salvacion, Clustered Precincts  
24, Precinct Nos. 0044A, and 0044B)

**The Solicitor General** (x)  
134 Amorsolo Street  
Legaspi Village, 1229 Makati City

**The Chairperson** (x)  
COMELEC  
**Atty. Jose M. Tolentino, Jr.** (x)  
Executive Director  
**Commissioner Robert S. Lim** (x)  
Project Director, 2016-AES Project  
Commission on Elections  
Intramuros, 1002 Manila  
**Ester L. Villaflor-Roxas** (x)  
Director IV  
Election Records and Statistics Department  
Commission on Elections  
Intramuros, 1002 Manila

**Nilo Aranda** (reg)  
Municipal Treasurer  
Office of the Municipal Treasurer  
San Antonio, Quezon

**Cynthia Patag** (reg)  
Puerto Real, La Paz,  
Iloilo