

Republic of the Philippines  
Presidential Electoral Tribunal  
Baguio City

NOTICE

Sirs/Mesdames:

*Please take notice that the Tribunal issued a Resolution dated APRIL 24, 2018, which reads as follows:*

**“P.E.T. Case No. 005** (Ferdinand ‘Bongbong’ R. Marcos, Jr. vs. Maria Leonor ‘Leni Daang Matuwid’ G. Robredo).- Acting on the Report dated April 16, 2018 of Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan, Retrieval Team Leader, the Tribunal Resolved to

(a) **AUTHORIZE** the travel to Iloilo Province on the date deemed best by the PET Ad Hoc Committee of the PET Retrieval Team, composed of the following personnel, to commence the collection of ballot boxes and their contents with their keys, if with locks; voter’s receipts (if not included inside or with the ballot boxes); list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter’s List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters from the two thousand seven hundred forty (2,740) clustered precincts in the Province of Iloilo:

Name	Designation
Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan	Retrieval Team Leader
Jeffrey Raymond S. Atienza	Special Disbursing Officer
	Assistant Special Disbursing Officer
Joery L. Gayanan	Assistant Chief Security Officer
Joselito Dominguiano	Security Officer
Mel Darien Aaron N. Buensalido	Assistant Ballot Box Custodian
Ryan R. Acoba	Assistant Books Custodian
Lloyd Christopher A. Bitas	Ballot Box Field Handler
Redentor G. Ciego	-do-
Earl Marvin D. Garcio	-do-
Rowell M. Marasigan	-do-
Ronaldo M. Pagsanjan	-do-



Bryan P. Puntero	-do-
Rendell B. Banaag	-do-
Psalm Exekiel S. Tecson	-do-
Thirteen (13) SC Security personnel	
Fourteen (14) Philippine Coast Guard	
Total Retrieval Team Personnel 40	

[The Retrieval Team shall be billeted at the GT Hotel Jaro, and if the hotel is not available on the period of retrieval, the Pearl View Hotel.]

(b) **AUTHORIZE** the PET Ad Hoc Committee to schedule the delivery to the designated staging area/hub of all the ballot boxes and their contents with their keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters and other election documents and paraphernalia used in the 2016 National and Local Elections for the Province of Iloilo, and to coordinate with the parties on the schedule of the delivery and to get the protestant's conformity to the costs of the retrieval;

(c) **DIRECT** (i) all City and Municipal Treasurers and Election officers to **DELIVER** to the PET Retrieval Team at the designated staging area/hub at the warehouse of the Philippine Span Asia Carrier Corporation (PSSAC), Barangay Balabago, Jaro, Iloilo City, all the ballot boxes and their contents with their keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters and other election documents and paraphernalia used in the 2016 National and Local Elections in accordance with the schedule determined by the PET Ad Hoc Committee; (ii) the Senate Electoral Tribunal (SET) where such election protests are pending to **DELIVER** to the Tribunal, through the P.E.T. Office in the SC-CA Gym, under proper receipt and with notice to the parties, the ballot boxes with keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters from the municipalities of Oton, Barbara, Dumangas and Iloilo City; and (iii) the Commission on Elections (COMELEC) and the House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal (HRET) to **DELIVER** to the Tribunal, through the P.E.T. Office, the ballot boxes, records, books, and list in their respective possession, including the uncollected ballot boxes and records/list/books from the Province of Camarines Sur, three hundred sixty-eight (368) from HRET and thirty-eight (38) from the COMELEC;



(d) **DIRECT** the Iloilo Police Provincial Officer of the Philippine National Police and the respective Chief of Police of the cities and municipalities of Iloilo to provide adequate police security and escorts when the ballot boxes, et al., are transported for delivery from the respective municipalities and cities mentioned above to the Retrieval Team's staging area/hub in PSSAC warehouse, Barangay Balabago, Jaro, Iloilo City;

(e) **DIRECT** the Chief of Police of the City of Manila to **PROVIDE** adequate police escort security to the Philpost Container vans when the convoy of trucks carrying the ballot boxes with keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters, upon or when said Philpost Trucks entered into their police area of jurisdiction going to the SC-CA Gym, Ma. Orosa Street, Ermita, Manila, from the Manila Port Area;

(f) **AUTHORIZE** the PET Retrieval Team to **REIMBURSE** the cost of transportation/trucking expenses incurred by Municipal/City Treasurers/Election Officers in connection with the delivery/collection of the aforesaid ballot boxes with keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters and other election documents and paraphernalia, provided that said expenses are properly receipted by official receipt, or in the absence thereof, by a certification by the Municipal Treasurer;

(g) **AUTHORIZE** the PHILPOST as the official carrier for transporting the ballot boxes with keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters and other election documents and paraphernalia from Iloilo Province, for delivery on a 'door-to-door' basis to the SC-CA Gym, Manila;

(h) **AUTHORIZE** Atty. Edgar O. Aricheta, Clerk of Court, to enter into a contract of carriage with the PHILPOST in connection with the abovementioned delivery of ballot boxes with keys, if with locks; list of voters, particularly the Election Day Computerized Voter's List (EDCVL); voters registration records (VRRs); and book of voters and other election documents and paraphernalia to Manila;

(i) **AUTHORIZE** the PET Retrieval Team, to augment the PET ballot box handlers, to hire fifteen (15) local haulers in the locality during the retrieval period and to pay the daily wage prevailing in the locality or the minimum wage rate provided by the National Wages and Productivity Commission; and



(j) **GRANT** the request of the Retrieval Team for approval of the following estimated expenses for the collection of ballot boxes and election documents in the Province of Iloilo, to wit:

<b>Travel and Accommodation Allowance:</b>	
PET Personnel, SC Security, Philippine Coast Guard (40 Members)	
Taxi fare (Claimant's Residence to Airport) @ 500.00/pax	500.00
Plane Fare to and from Iloilo	15,000.00
Taxi Fare (Airport to Temporary Residence) @ 500.00/pax	500.00
Taxi Fare (Temporary Residence to Airport) @ 500.00/pax	500.00
Taxi fare (Airport to Claimant's residence) @ 500.00/pax	500.00
Subtotal	17,000.00
Subtotal x 40 Members	₱680,000.00
Lodging/Accommodation for 15 days @ 2,000.00/pax/night x 13 pax (PET Personnel)	390,000.00
Travel Allowance (15 days @ 1,500.00/day) x 13 pax	292,500.00
Subtotal	₱682,500.00
<b>Total Travel Expenses</b>	<b>₱1,362,500.00</b>
<b>SC, Security, PCG and PNP Personnel Special Allowance:</b>	
SC Security 14 pax x 3,500.00 x 15 days	735,000.00
Philippine Coast Guard 13 pax x 3,500.00 x 15 days	682,500.00
Iloilo Province Police Escort 20 pax x 500.00 x 42 Municipalities	420,000.00
Iloilo and Passi City Police Escort 20 pax x 500.00 x 2	20,000.00
Iloilo City Police Office 13 pax x 500.00 x 15 days	97,500.00
Iloilo City CDM 50pax x 500.00 x 10 days	250,000.00
PNPIPPO-PPMF-Escort Two (2) Teams 16 pax x 500.00 x 5 days	40,000.00
PNP IPPO&ICPO Officers:	
Provincial Director	5,000.00

9



Provincial Deputy Director for Operations	4,000.00
Provincial Deputy Director for Admin	4,000.00
City Director	5,000.00
City Deputy Director for Operations	4,000.00
City Deputy Director for Admin	4,000.00
PNP-WPD Escort Security 6 pax x 1,000.00 x 2 days	12,000.00
Gas Allocation:	
Municipal Police Vehicle 42 x 2,000.00	84,000.00
PPMF Vehicles 2 x 2,000.00 X 5 days	20,000.00
PNP-WPD Mobile 2 X 1,000.00 X 2 days	4,000.00
<b>Total SC Security, PCG and PNP Special Allowance</b>	<b>₱2,391,000.00</b>
Cost of Transportation of Ballot Boxes from Municipalities and Cities to the Staging Area	550,000.00
Hauling and Trucking (PHILPOST)	4,331,930.27
Local Haulers 15 pax x 400.00 x 7 days	42,000.00
Van Rental (Mobility) @ 2,500.00/day x 15 days	37,500.00
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>₱8,714,930.27</b>
Miscellaneous/Incidental Expenses 5%	₱435,746.51
Contingency @ 15%	₱1,307,239.54
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>₱10,457,916.32</b>

The Tribunal further Resolved to

(a) **NOTE** the Second Manifestation of Grave Concern dated April 16, 2018 filed by counsel for protestee Maria Leonor G. Robredo;

(b) **REQUIRE** protestant Ferdinand R. Marcos, Jr. and the COMELEC to **COMMENT**, within ten (10) days from notice hereof, on the Urgent Motion for Reconsideration (of the Resolution Dated April 10, 2018) with Reiterative Prayer to Immediately Direct the Head Revisors to Use the Twenty-Five (25%) Threshold Percentage in the Revision, Recount and Re-Appreciation of Ballots dated April 18, 2018 filed by counsel for protestee Robredo;

(c) **NOTE WITHOUT ACTION** the Letter dated April 16, 2018 filed by Atty. George Erwin M. Garcia, lead counsel for protestant Marcos, Jr., in view of the above requirement to file comment;



(d) **NOTE** the Counter-Manifestation (to Protestee's Second Manifestation of Grave Concern Dated April 16, 2018), dated April 19, 2018 filed by counsel for protestant Marcos, Jr.;

(e) **NOTE** the Letter dated April 19, 2018 of Atty. Maria Bernadette V. Sardillo of Sardillo Sardillo Salom Law Office for protestee Robredo and **GRANT** her request for the turnover to them of the compact disks (CDs) that they provided to the COMELEC during the decryption of the Secure Digital (SD) cards;

(f) **DIRECT** the Clerk of the Tribunal to **TURNOVER** the aforesaid CDs to the counsel for protestee Robredo;

(g) **REQUIRE** counsel for protestee Robredo to **COORDINATE** with the Office of the Clerk of the Tribunal on the turnover of the subject CDs;

(h) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated April 13, 2018 relative to the alleged inappropriate behavior of Atty. Joan M. Padilla, the party supervisor of protestant Marcos, Jr., in the morning of April 13, 2018 and **ADMONISH** the said lawyer and **SPECIFICALLY ORDER** her not to talk to any of the head revisors and not to disrupt the revision process in general;

(i) **NOTE** the following Incident Reports, however, the revision of the decrypted ballot images shall be done only after the revision of all the ballot boxes from Camarines Sur currently in the custody of the Tribunal:

(1) Incident Report dated April 3, 2018 relative to the wet ballots and election returns and voters' receipts in Bato, Brgy. San Vicente Clustered Precinct No. 48, Precinct Nos. 0103-A, 0103-B, 0103-C and 0103-D and absence of the voter's receipt box inside the ballot box;

(2) Incident Report dated April 2, 2018 relative to the soiled/wet ballots in Clustered Precinct No. 17030034, Precincts in Cluster 0073-A, 0073-B and 0074-A, Camarines Sur (Province), Bato (Municipality), Niño Jesus (Barangay);

(3) Incident Report dated April 2, 2018 relative to the wet ballots in Brgy. Agos, Clustered Precinct Nos. 0040-A, 0040-B and 0041-A; 9



(4) Incident Report dated April 2, 2018 relative to the wet ballots in Brgy. Catmon, Clustered Precinct Nos. 0053-A and 0053-B;

(5) Incident Report dated April 2, 2018 relative to the wet ballots in Brgy. Sta. Cruz, Precinct 8, Cluster 0018-A, 0018-B, 0019-A and 0019-B;

(6) Incident Report dated April 10, 2018 relative to Ballot Box No. 25 (Clustered Precincts 0062A, 0062B, 0063A and 0063B) of Sto. Niño, Sagñay, Camarines Sur, at Table No. 12;

(7) Incident Report dated April 10, 2018 relative to Box No. 17 (Clustered Precinct Nos. 0043A and 0044A), Brgy. Minadongjol, Sagñay Camarines Sur, at Table No. 16;

(8) Incident Report dated April 10, 2018 relative to Box No. 8 (0022A, 0022B, 0023A and 0023B Clustered Precincts), Baracan, Sagñay, Camarines Sur, at Table No. 3;

(9) Incident Report dated April 18, 2018 relative to Table No. 20, Municipality of Garchitorena, Brgy. Salvacion, Clustered Precincts 24, Precinct Nos. 0044A, and 0044B;

(10) Incident Report dated April 17, 2018 relative to the wet/soiled ballots (Precinct No. 31, Ocampo, San Francisco), Table No. 20; and

(11) Incident Report dated April 2, 2018 relative to the wet ballots in Bato, Brgy. San Isidro, Clustered Precinct No. 41, Precinct Nos. 0089-A and 0089-B;

and **REQUIRE** the Municipal Treasurers to **EXPLAIN**, within ten (10) days from notice hereof, why the ballots were wet or damaged;

(j) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated April 2, 2018 relative to the re-opening of ballot box Clustered Precinct No. 41, Precinct Nos. 0089-A and 0089-B, Barangay San Isidro (Table 38);

(k) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated April 10, 2018 relative to Ballot Box No. 25 at Table 12 for Clustered Precincts 0062A, 0062B, 0063A and 0063B for Santo Niño, Sagñay, Camarines Sur, that contained wet ballots and was re-sealed




without the broken security seal returned back inside the box prior to re-sealing;

(l) **NOTE** the Incident Report dated April 13, 2018 relative to Table No. 1, Clustered Precinct No. 32 (79A, 79B, 79C and 85A), Brgy. Palsong, Bula, Camarines Sur, where the physical count of valid votes cast is greater by 1 (one) than the valid votes cast as reflected in the ER and **REFER** the same to the **PET COMMISSIONERS** for appropriate action;

(m) **NOTE** the Letter dated April 11, 2018 of Atty. Jose M. Tolentino, Jr., Executive Director, COMELEC; **GRANT** the request of Director J. Thaddeus P. Hernan, Administrative Services Department, COMELEC, for authority to access the Memory Configuration Area at the COMELEC Sta. Rosa Warehouse to effect repairs thereon in the presence of the PET representatives and the parties to the instant PET case; and **DIRECT** the COMELEC to notify in advance the Tribunal and the parties of the schedule of the aforesaid repairs; and

(n) **NOTE** the Memorandum dated April 23, 2018 submitted by the PET Commissioners in connection with the Manifestation of Grave Concern dated April 4, 2018 filed by protestee Robredo and **AFFIRM** the finding expressed therein by the PET Commissioners that the actions of the Head Revisors complained of by the protestee in her Manifestation were in conformity with the applicable revision guidelines promulgated by the Tribunal." Sereno, C.J., on leave. (1)

Very truly yours,

  
**EDGAR O. ARICHETA**  
Clerk of the Tribunal *mlbme*

**Atty. George Erwin M. Garcia and**  
**Atty. Joan M. Padilla (x)**  
*Counsel for the Protestant*  
G.E. Garcia Law Office  
Ground Floor Laiko Building  
372 Cabildo Street  
Intramuros, 1002 Manila

**The Chairperson (x)**  
COMELEC  
**Atty. Jose M. Tolentino, Jr. (x)**  
Executive Director  
**Commissioner Robert S. Lim (x)**  
Project Director, 2016-AES Project  
Commission on Elections  
Intramuros, 1002 Manila

**Atty. Romulo B. Macalintal (x)**  
*Lead Counsel for the Protestee*  
Sardillo Sardillo Salom Law Office  
Unit 802, Taipan Place  
F. Ortigas Avenue  
Ortigas Center, Pasig City

**Atty. Maria Bernadette V. Sardillo (x)**  
*Collaborating Counsel for Vice-President*  
*Maria Leonor G. Robredo*  
Sardillo Sardillo Salom Law Office  
Unit 802, Taipan Place, F. Ortigas Avenue Ortigas Center,  
Pasig City  
(for this resolution only)



April 24, 2018

**Ester L. Villaflor-Roxas** (x)  
Director IV  
Election Records and Statistics Department  
**Atty. Rey D. Doma** (x)  
Director III  
**Director J. Thaddeus P. Hernan** (x)  
Administrative Services Department  
Commission on Elections  
Intramuros, 1002 Manila

**The Solicitor General** (x)  
134 Amorsolo Street  
Legaspi Village, 1229 Makati City

**Atty. Eden T. Candelaria** (x)  
Acting Administrative Officer  
Chairperson, *Ad Hoc* Committee, PET

**Atty. Ma. Carina M. Cunanan** (x)  
Acting Assistant Administrative Officer and  
Vice-Chairperson, *Ad Hoc* Committee, PET

**The Postmaster General and CEO** (x)  
Philippine Postal Corporation  
Manila

**Atty. Joan M. Padilla** (x)  
Party Supervisor of Protestant Marcos, Jr.  
c/o Atty. Jose Limuel S. Arenas  
Office of Associate Justice Alfredo Benjamin  
S. Caguioa

**The Municipal Treasurer** (reg)  
Office of the Municipal Treasurer  
Bato, Camarines Sur

**The City Treasurer** (reg)  
Office of the City Treasurer  
Naga City, Camarines Sur

**The Municipal Treasurer** (reg)  
Office of the Municipal Treasurer  
Baao, Camarines Sur

**The Municipal Treasurer** (reg)  
Office of the Municipal Treasurer  
Ocampo, Camarines Sur

**The Municipal Treasurer** (reg)  
Office of the Municipal Treasurer  
Sagñay, Camarines Sur

**The Municipal Treasurer** (reg)  
Office of the Municipal Treasurer  
Garchitorea, Camarines Sur

**Public Information Office** (x)  
Supreme Court

**(Ret.) Justice Jose C. Vitug** (x)  
373 Matienzo Street, San Miguel, Manila  
(with copy of the Incident Report dated April 13, 2018)

**Atty. Angelito C. Imperio** (x)  
17 Third Street, Saint Ignatius Village  
Quezon City  
(with copy of the Incident Report dated April 13, 2018)

**Atty. Irene Ragodon-Guevarra** (x)  
Lot 12, Blk 25 Carnation Street  
Primrose Hills Subdivision  
Mahabang Parang, Angono, Rizal  
(with copy of the Incident Report dated April 13, 2018)

**PET Retrieval Team**  
c/o Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan (x)  
Office of the Chief Attorney

**City and Municipal Treasurers**  
**Iloilo Police Provincial Officer, PNP**  
**and the respective Chiefs of Police of the**  
**Cities and Municipalities of Iloilo Province**  
c/o Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan (x)  
Office of the Chief Attorney

**Chief of Police of the City of Manila**  
c/o Atty. Linuel G. Alindogan (x)  
Office of the Chief Attorney

**Senate Electoral Tribunal** (x)  
**House of Representatives Electoral Tribunal** (x)  
Electoral Tribunals Building  
COA Compound  
Batasan Road corner Commonwealth Avenue  
Quezon City